

## Response

Joshua Gunn

I am grateful for the response by Ernest Bormann, John F. Cragan, and Donald C. Shields, which not only highlights divergences of approach but also details recent work done using SCT. I especially appreciate their willingness to return to Freud to identify similarities and differences in methods of interpretation. I take issue, however, with their claim that I “misquote,” “misuse,” and misunderstand Freud’s *The Interpretation of Dreams* because I replace the term “transcript” with “translation” in a key line, and because I omit a sentence that presumably supports their cause.<sup>1</sup> The authors claim that my “problem with understanding Freud begins with [my] selection of the Strachey translation,” which they rightly note has been disputed by a number of scholars.<sup>2</sup> If they had consulted the A.A. Brill translation that they recommend or the most recent translation by Joyce Crick, however, they would have seen that my use of “translation” for the German *Übertragung* (literally “carrying over”) is commonplace in the context of the line in question.<sup>3</sup> Perhaps comparing these alternative scripts and reading more extensively about the dreamwork would lead them to conclude that the interpretation of dreams, like that of fantasies, is not as easy as the interpretation of Freud, presumably an uncomplicated matter of “comparing the original and the translation.”

### Notes

<sup>1</sup> Ernest Bormann, John F. Cragan, and Donald C. Shields, “Defending Symbolic Convergence Theory From an Imaginary Gunn,” *Quarterly Journal of Speech* 89 (2003): page no to follow, and notes 27 and 28.

<sup>2</sup>Bormann, Cragan, and Shields, “Defending,” note 28. However flawed, Strachey’s translation remains a part of the *Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud* according to the Institute for Psycho-Analysis. A revised standard edition is presumably in the works; see Joyce Crick, “Note on the Translation,” in Sigmund Freud, *The Interpretation of Dreams*, trans. Joyce Crick (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), xli.

<sup>3</sup>See Sigmund Freud, *Die Traumdeutung*, vol. 2, *Gesammelte Werke* (Frankfurt am Main: Fischer Verlag, 1999), 283. My thanks to Mirko M. Hall for this reference. Also see Sigmund Freud, *The Interpretation of Dreams*, trans. A. A. Brill (New York: The Modern Library, 1994), 174; Sigmund Freud, *The Interpretation of Dreams*, trans. Joyce Crick (New York: Oxford University Press), 211.

Copyright of Quarterly Journal of Speech is the property of National Communication Association and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.